

## STACKING THE DECKS IN WARREN COUNTY

Richard Hayes Phillips, Ph.D.  
April 18, 2006

In my previous paper, entitled "Pick a Card, Any Card," I set forth compelling statistical and circumstantial evidence of election fraud in Warren County, Ohio. Because the order in which the candidates' names appear on the ballot rotates from precinct to precinct, and because the punch code at the bottom of the punch card ballots does not identify the precinct, it would have been easy to take a number of ballots punched for John Kerry and move them to a different precinct where they would be counted as votes for George W. Bush.

Other Democratic candidates on the ballot would suffer collateral damage as the vote totals in their races would be reversed, but they could end up with more votes than Kerry. Issue One, the constitutional amendment prohibiting gay marriage, was not subject to ballot rotation, so gay-friendly Democrats whose ballots were switched would be counted as gay-friendly Republicans.

Analysis of 775 punch card ballots in Warren County Precinct 149 (MAS C WC AFS) indicates that this is exactly what happened. Kerry got 59 fewer votes than Ellen Connally, the losing Democratic candidate for Chief Justice; and Bush got 94 more votes than Issue One, which passed overwhelmingly. Either Bush got 60.1% of the Connally voters, and 48.8% of the gay marriage supporters, or punch cards have been shuffled from another precinct.

In addition, there are individual ballots indicative of ballot box stuffing. There were four ballots punched for Bush only, and six ballots that were punched for Bush and only one other position. If these are fraudulent ballots, then the voter signature book should reveal an equivalent number of forgeries. Also, there were two ballots punched for odd numbers for president. Only even numbered choices for president were valid and available -- #2, #4, #6, #8 and #10. Odd numbers could not have been punched unless the punch card was outside the voting machine. This is indicative of "undervotes" (ballots containing no choice for president) being punched for Bush and run back through the tabulators. If this was done in a hurry, odd numbers could have been punched by mistake.

Since writing my original paper I have analyzed, ballot by ballot, three more precincts in Warren County - Precinct 118 (CLC T NM ABM), Precinct 128 (MAS C NEA AAY), and Precinct 155 (LEB C SEB AFY). In overview: Either Bush got 53.3%, 52.7%, 62.7% of the Ellen Connally voters, respectively, and Bush got 48.0%, 51.6%, and 53.6% of the gay marriage supporters, respectively, or punch cards have been shuffled from other precincts. The complete results are appended to this paper.

Each of the three precincts had one example of a ballot with an odd number punched for president. Precincts 128 and 155 both had one example of a ballot containing no punches for any office or ballot issue, evidence of an imperfect attempt to stuff the ballot box.

Precinct 155 had one ballot punched only for Bush, and Precinct 128 had four - one of them being the bright pink "header card" that should have identified the precinct; instead, it was punched for Bush and counted as a vote.

There were many examples of ballots punched for Republican candidates in six contested races - President, U. S. Senate, U. S. Congress, Ohio Chief Justice, and two Associate Justice positions - yet also punched against Issue One (for gay marriage). If these cards were shuffled from other precincts, then these voters were gay-friendly Democrats, not gay-friendly Republicans, and the theft of votes from John Kerry caused collateral damage to the entire Democratic ticket. There were 36 such ballots in Precinct 118, and 34 such ballots in Precinct 128.

There is statistical corroboration for stuffing of the ballot boxes in Warren County. Voter turnout, calculated as the number of ballots cast divided by the number of registered voters, was reportedly 71.76% state wide, and 76.31% county wide. By comparison, voter turnout was 83.23% in Precinct 118, 83.74% in Precinct 128, 83.39% in Precinct 149, and 86.52% in Precinct 155. Altogether, 54 of 157 precincts in Warren County reported voter turnout above 80%, ranging as high as 87.08% in Precinct 95 (HAM T M ADF), for which we have photographs of the ballots. The complete listing of precincts with more than 80% voter turnout is appended to this paper. The number of ballots cast in Warren County was up by 36.23% compared to the 2000 presidential election, the second highest percentage in the state, behind only Delaware County with 45.06%.

There is statistical corroboration for punching of undervotes for Bush in Warren County. For each county in Ohio, the number of uncounted ballots can be determined by subtracting the votes counted for president from the number of ballots cast. This would be the sum total of "undervotes" (ballots with no choice for president) and "overvotes" (ballots with two or more choices for president). 68 of 88 Ohio counties utilized punch card ballots in the 2004 presidential election. The percentage of uncounted ballots was 2.01% in all 68 punch card counties combined, but only 1.14% in Warren County, the second lowest percentage in the state, behind only Delaware County with 0.89%.

In Warren County, less than 0.5% uncounted ballots were reported in 26 of 157 precincts (16.6%), the second highest percentage in the state, behind only Delaware County with 23 of 153 precincts (18.7%).

In these 26 precincts in Warren County, there were 51 uncounted ballots out of 15,550 ballots cast (0.33%). 299 of every 300 voters made a choice for president, and punched their cards correctly. Either that, or the official results are not true and correct. The complete listing of precincts with less than 0.5% uncounted ballots is appended to this paper.

Two precincts in Warren County reported zero uncounted ballots. One of them was Precinct 118 (CLC T NM ABM), where all 839 voters made a choice for president and punched their cards correctly. Actually, we know this is not true, because one card was punched for #10 and #11 for president. But there were zero undervotes. No hanging chads, no dimpled chads, and nobody who wanted "none of the above."

Officially, there were 8 uncounted ballots in Precinct 128. Examination of the ballots reveals that there was only one deliberate undervote, an intentional choice of "none of the above" for president. There were two ballots inserted backwards, one punched for #1, one punched for #1 and #2, one vote for Nader, one write-in (identified by precinct, in handwriting), and one ballot containing no punches at all.

Officially, there were 8 uncounted ballots in Precinct 149. Actually, there were only three deliberate undervotes. There was one ballot punched for #2, #6, #8 and #10 (every candidate except Peroutka), one vote for Nader, one dimpled chad for Kerry, and two ballots punched for #7 or #9 in an apparent failed attempt to manufacture votes for Bush, who was in position #8 in this precinct.

Officially, there were 10 uncounted ballots in Precinct 155. Actually, there were four deliberate undervotes. There were four misaligned ballots, one ballot punched for #6 and #7 (Bush was in position #6 in this precinct), and one ballot containing no punches at all.

If these three precincts are any indication, less than one-third (8 of 26, or 30.8%) of the uncounted ballots were undervotes. Warren County officially reported 1097 uncounted ballots out of 95,512 ballots cast, or 1.15%. If only 30% of these were undervotes, this would amount to 330 ballots in 157 precincts, a number so low as to give immediate cause to examine all the ballots in Warren County.

However, as stated in my previous paper, stuffing the ballot box, whether by punching undervotes for Bush or manufacturing votes outright, cannot explain the large anomalies in the vote totals. The cause for greatest concern is the fact that the punch code at the bottom of the punch cards is the same for every precinct in Warren County, whereas in other counties in Ohio, the punch code identifies the precinct. This makes it possible to shuffle the punch card ballots from precinct to precinct in order to manipulate the vote count on the tabulator. This would explain perfectly the official county wide results, which show Kerry with 2,427 fewer votes than Ellen Connally, and Bush with 4,606 more votes than Issue One. And it would explain perfectly the results of the four hand-counted precincts, where Bush got 57.7% (486 of 842) Ellen Connally voters, and 50.2% (472 of 940) gay marriage supporters.

I do not believe that most of the supporters of gay marriage were secret admirers of George W. Bush. I find it more likely that some of the punch cards, which the tabulator could not identify by precinct, were shifted to other precincts where a vote for Kerry would be counted as a vote for Bush.

This was a presidential election, with the leadership of the free world at stake. Ohio was the state that decided the election. I am not a lawyer, but it is my understanding that stacking the decks of cards in a high-stakes game is racketeering.

HAND COUNT, WARREN COUNTY, CLEAR CREEK, PRECINCT 118 CLC T NM ABM

BUSH VOTERS			KERRY VOTERS		
	Yes	No		Yes	No
Moyer	322	76	Moyer	12	37
Connally	70	36	Connally	16	76
Moyer	4		Moyer	0	
Connally	0		Connally	1	
Yes	101		Yes	11	
No	22		No	32	
Bush	18		Kerry	2	
	Badnarik			1	
	Peroutka			1	
	Numbers 10 & 11			1	
	Bush			649	
	Kerry			187	
	Others			2	
	Void			1	
	Total			839	

**Analysis:**

Bush got 402 (89.1%) of the Moyer voters  
 106 (53.3%) of the Connally voters  
 493 (92.7%) of the Yes voters  
 134 (48.0%) of the No voters

**Note:** These percentages do not include  
 ballots cast for neither Bush nor Kerry

HAND COUNT, WARREN COUNTY, MASON CITY, PRECINCT 128 MAS C NEA AAY

BUSH VOTERS			KERRY VOTERS		
	Yes	No		Yes	No
Moyer	214	57	Moyer	9	31
Connally	62	24	Connally	18	58
Moyer	1		Moyer	0	
Connally	1		Connally	2	
Yes	73		Yes	7	
No	30		No	15	
Bush	9		Kerry	2	
	Badnarik			2	
	Nader			1	
	Write-In			1	
	Number 1			1	
	Numbers 1 & 2			1	
	Undervotes			4	
	Bush			471	
	Kerry			142	
	Others			4	
	Void			6	
	Total			623	

**Analysis:**

Bush got 272 (87.2%) of the Moyer voters  
87 (52.7%) of the Connally voters  
349 (91.1%) of the Yes voters  
111 (51.6%) of the No voters

**Note:** These percentages do not include  
ballots cast for neither Bush nor Kerry

HAND COUNT, WARREN COUNTY, MASON CITY, PRECINCT 149 MAS C WC AFS

BUSH VOTERS			KERRY VOTERS		
	Yes	No		Yes	No
Moyer	244	62	Moyer	18	25
Connally	109	42	Connally	22	76
Moyer	7		Moyer	0	
Connally	1		Connally	3	
Yes	71		Yes	16	
No	19		No	28	
Bush	19		Kerry	5	
	Nader			1	
	Undervotes			4	
	Overvotes			1	
	Number 9			1	
	Numbers 7 & 8			1	
	Bush			574	
	Kerry			193	
	Nader			1	
	Void			7	
	Total			775	

**Analysis:**

Bush got 313 (87.9%) of the Moyer voters  
 152 (60.1%) of the Connally voters  
 424 (88.3%) of the Yes voters  
 123 (48.8%) of the No voters

**Note:** These percentages do not include  
 ballots cast for neither Bush nor Kerry

HAND COUNT, WARREN COUNTY, LEBANON CITY, PRECINCT 155 LEB C SEB AFY

BUSH VOTERS			KERRY VOTERS		
	Yes	No		Yes	No
Moyer	233	40	Moyer	13	14
Connally	99	42	Connally	26	58
Moyer	3		Moyer	0	
Connally	0		Connally	0	
Yes	63		Yes	7	
No	22		No	18	
Bush	9		Kerry	2	
	Peroutka			2	
	Badnarik			1	
	Nader			1	
	Undervotes			7	
	Numbers 6 & 7			1	
	Bush			511	
	Kerry			138	
	Others			4	
	Void			8	
	Total			775	

**Analysis:**

Bush got 276 (91.1%) of the Moyer voters  
 141 (62.7%) of the Connally voters  
 395 (89.6%) of the Yes voters  
 104 (53.6%) of the No voters

**Note:** These percentages do not include  
 ballots cast for neither Bush nor Kerry

PRECINCTS WITH LESS THAN 0.5% UNCOUNTED BALLOTS, WARREN COUNTY

Precinct	Registered Voters	Ballots Cast	Bush	Kerry	-- Uncounted --	
					Number	Percent
CLC T NM ABM	1008	839	650	187	0	0.000%
FRA T SEC ACT	468	369	250	118	0	0.000%
TC T NWA ADZ	696	570	457	110	1	0.175%
HAM T WA ADJ	1368	1058	752	302	2	0.189%
SPG C EA AES	566	455	323	131	1	0.220%
SPG C NWA AEY	488	394	286	104	1	0.254%
LEB C NWB AAP	912	752	544	202	2	0.266%
SPG C M AEW	520	370	236	131	1	0.270%
DEF T SW ACH	870	729	523	200	2	0.274%
MASSIE TWP ADQ	432	353	250	99	1	0.283%
DEF T SMB ACB	1100	683	448	231	2	0.293%
DEF T SEA ABX	813	617	426	185	2	0.324%
DEF T SEB ABY	737	556	376	175	2	0.360%
TC T NE ADY	671	556	453	99	2	0.360%
WAY T W AEP	656	530	415	111	2	0.377%
DEF T NM ABV	954	515	345	165	2	0.388%
SPG C NWC AFA	649	507	373	132	2	0.394%
TC T M ADX	592	491	389	98	2	0.407%
HAR T S AND	639	474	372	99	2	0.422%
HAM T WC AFR	893	698	474	220	3	0.430%
SPG C NEA AFN	872	696	537	154	3	0.431%
SPG C SEA AFO	836	658	470	185	3	0.456%
SPG C SE AFB	985	831	606	220	4	0.481%
DEF T WM ACJ	1044	830	555	270	4	0.482%
CLC T SA ABN	795	616	472	141	3	0.487%
LEB C EB AAK	582	403	276	124	2	0.496%
SUBTOTAL	20146	15550	11258	4193	51	0.328%
COUNTY WIDE	125165	95512	68035	26043	1097	1.149%



PRECINCTS WITH MORE THAN 80% VOTER TURNOUT, WARREN COUNTY

Precinct	Registered Voters	Ballots Cast	Percent Turnout	Bush	Kerry
HAM T M ADF	867	755	87.08%	551	193
CLC T EA ABJ	1143	993	86.88%	744	237
LEB C SEB AFY	764	661	86.52%	510	138
FRA T SEB ACS	701	604	86.16%	442	149
MAS C NWA AFP	883	757	85.73%	591	161
MAS C NEC AFV	824	704	85.44%	547	152
HAM T S ADI	1026	869	84.70%	662	197
SPG C SE AFB	985	831	84.37%	606	220
SPG C EM AEV	792	667	84.22%	507	151
DEF T SW ACH	870	729	83.79%	523	200
MAS C NEA AAY	744	623	83.74%	471	143
MAS C WC AFS	933	778	83.39%	574	196
CLC T NM ABM	1008	839	83.23%	650	187
DEF T SM ACD	840	698	83.10%	464	218
MAS C WB AFL	1142	948	83.01%	754	187
TC T M ADX	592	491	82.94%	389	98
DEF T N ABW	1142	947	82.92%	738	198
TC T NWB AEA	928	769	82.87%	592	166
TC T NE ADY	671	556	82.86%	453	99
CLC T EC AFK	662	546	82.48%	406	132
LEB C NWB AAP	912	752	82.46%	544	202
DEF T WA AFT	789	650	82.38%	453	189
DEF T SMA ACA	498	410	82.33%	319	87
MAS C SC AFW	522	429	82.18%	334	91
TC T EM ADW	1024	841	82.13%	665	168
HAM T WB ADK	1019	836	82.04%	665	164
DEF T KM ABS	790	647	81.90%	488	150
TC T NWA ADZ	696	570	81.90%	457	110
CLC T WB ABQ	882	722	81.86%	507	207
MAS C W ABI	1062	869	81.83%	621	233
WASH T N AEK	840	687	81.79%	527	153
MAS C NE AAZ	581	475	81.76%	361	107
CLC T EB ABK	1002	819	81.74%	633	175
MASSIE TWP ADQ	432	353	81.71%	250	99
DEF T NMA AFI	595	485	81.51%	348	133
SPG C NE AEX	838	683	81.50%	516	159
CLC T M ABL	1064	866	81.39%	656	194
SPG C NEB AFX	736	599	81.39%	437	154
DEF T M ABU	775	630	81.29%	450	171
FRA T SWC ACX	468	380	81.20%	237	133
DEF T SWB ACF	625	507	81.12%	377	122
MAS C SWC ABG	796	645	81.03%	477	163
FRA T NWC ACQ	300	243	81.00%	149	89
MAS C SE ABB	981	794	80.94%	585	193
WAY T E AEM	887	717	80.83%	543	159
WAY T W AEP	656	530	80.79%	415	111
SPG C NWA AEY	488	394	80.74%	286	104
FRA T S ACU	594	478	80.47%	332	141
SAL T S ADS	891	717	80.47%	523	182
TC T SE AEB	890	716	80.45%	564	140
DEF T WMA ACI	757	609	80.45%	420	178
SPG C EA AES	566	455	80.39%	323	131
HAR T N ADM	1079	865	80.17%	666	188
FRA T SWB ACW	794	636	80.10%	380	240
COUNTY WIDE	125165	95512	76.31%	68035	26043